

**Minutes of the 17<sup>th</sup> Goa State Expert Appraisal Committee  
(Goa-SEAC) meeting held on 24<sup>th</sup> February 2014 at 10.30 a.m. in the  
Conference Room of the EIA Secretariat, O/o Goa State Pollution  
Control Board (GSPCB), Patto-Panaji**

The seventeenth meeting of the Goa-SEAC was held on 24<sup>th</sup> February 2014 in the Conference room of the GSPCB at 10.30 a.m. under the Chairmanship of Prof. Antonio Jaime Afonso. The list of members who attended the meeting is at “Annexure – 1”.

At the outset, the Secretary welcomed the Chairman and Members of Committee. Subsequently, with the permission of the Chair, he requested project proponents for presentation on project proposals for appraisal, deliberation and suitable recommendation as per Agenda Items (refer Annexure – 2).

**1. Proposal for issuance of Terms of Reference (ToR) towards establishment of two Common Municipal Solid Waste Management Facilities (CMSWMF) in the State – one at Saligao (North Goa) and another at Cacora (South Goa).**

Name of the Project Proponent : Department of Science, Technology and Environment, Government of Goa

Technical Consultant : National Environmental Engineering Research Institute (NEERI), Nagpur

The power-point presentation was made by Mr. Dominic Fernandes, OSD to the Department of Science, Technology and Environment (DST&E), Goa, highlighting the site-specific salient features, process methodology to be adopted vis-à-vis environment management plan including landfill characteristics for disposal of inerts. The process is based on mechanical sorting / segregation (dry and wet waste), recycling, bio-methanation with in-vessel composting at both the locations was discussed. It was informed that both these sites proposed for setting up of a CMSWMF were used as dumping sites since past. The first step for solid waste management is segregation at source which has already been initiated at the Panchayat levels. The mixed dry-waste consisting of paper, plastic, glass, metal is reduced to inert blocks, compost, and bio-gas, refused derived fuel (RDF), in a phase-wise manner at various stages of waste treatment, as well as generates electricity. As the process involves in-vessel composting, the possibility odours or gas emanation or release of any liquid effluents / leachates is ruled out.

The Members had detailed discussion / deliberation with the technical-design consultant and sought clarification about process and output characteristics from the said

treatment technology. Further, it was decided to visit both these sites to ascertain on-site status prior to issue TORs' to enable the consultant to undertake Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) studies as mandated in the EIA Notification, 2006.

This was followed by consideration of Minor Mineral quarry proposals seeking environmental clearance (EC) either for new or renewal of lease (*i.e. basalt and laterite stone refer 2(1) to 2(13) in Annexure-2*) in terms of project activity 1(a), category 'B' as per the 'Schedule' annexed to the EIA Notification, 2006 as well as in compliance to the – (1) Office Memorandum (O.M.) No. L-11011/47/2011-IA.II (M) dated 18<sup>th</sup> May 2012, (2) Directions as per section (5) of the Environment (Protection) Act, 1986 bearing no. No. 1-4/2012-RE (Pt.) dated 13<sup>th</sup> November 2013 and (3) Office Memorandum (O.M.) bearing no. No. 1-4/2012-RE (Pt.) dated 20<sup>th</sup> December 2013 issued by the Ministry of Environment & Forests (MoEF).

Subsequently, quarry-specific project presentations were made by environmental consultants on behalf of respective quarry lease holders concerned in the following order. The minutes of the detailed deliberations held during the 'pre-presentation panel discussion and analysis' meeting on 20<sup>th</sup> February 2014 (*i.e. 16<sup>th</sup> Goa-SEAC meeting*) was referred to after every quarry-specific presentation. Such compilation was also communicated, through e-mail, to all consultants concerned for suitable compliance / submission of clarification. Accordingly, these proposals were taken up for appraisal and suitable recommendations.

**1. Quarry Project: New Laterite Murrum quarry located at Sy. No. 139 of Agarwada village, Pernem taluka, North Goa District (lease area – 4,000 Sq. mts) of Mr. Anthony Nadan.**

Project Proponent: Mr. Anthony Nadan  
Consultant: Mr. Ravi Kumar, M/s Carmel Enterprises

The consultant could not make the power-point presentation on the said proposal. Further, Members objected to the consultant's non-preparedness to clarify various concerns raised. The proponent has been requested to comply with the following –

1. The project proponent shall demarcate the lease boundary with cement poles and also develop proper approach road.

2. Submission of ephemeral biodiversity inventory in and around the proposed lease area, geological report.

**2. Quarry Project: Renewal of Basalt quarry located at Sy. No. 66/0 of Allorna village, Pernem taluka, North Goa District (lease area - 4000 Sq.mts ) of M/s Sastpurush Metal Industries**

Project Proponent: M/s Satpurush Metal Industries  
Consultant: Mr. B. G. Joshi and associates

The Members suggested the proponent to construct a series of settling ponds prior to the release of water outside its lease to be utilized for desired usage. The Members also desired that a Cumulative-EIA needs to be attempted for all such minor mineral quarry leases which form a cluster or lie within close vicinity of each other (*i.e.* 1 – 2 kms.) in Allorna village so as to suitably address probable environmental concerns and suggest mitigative measures. One of the Members recommended planting of indigenous species in place of *Australian acacia* as a part of dump-reclamation programme. Further, considering the close proximity of the said lease to other quarries within the peripheral limits of 500 mts., opined that cumulative impact may be ascertained jointly by respective lease holders. The proponent has been requested to comply with the following –

- i. Submission of antecedents of the opened-up area.
- ii. Key Plan of the lease area and its peripheral limits upto 5 kms. with the help of Survey of India (SOI) toposheets and Google Map.
- iii. Demarcation / delineation of permanent water sources within the vicinity of the lease area.

**3. Quarry Project: Renewal of Basalt quarry located at Sy. Nos. 36/1 and 37/0 of Allorna village, Pernem taluka, North Goa District (lease area - 9,320 and 15,200 Sq.mts. respectively) of Pramod Kamat and Prashant Kamat.**

Project Proponent: Pramod Kamat / Prashant Kamat  
Consultant: Ravindra Patil – rep. M/s Srusti Envirocare.

Members opined that proponents, having a common lease boundary, should use abandoned pits as settling ponds before releasing the impounded water in the field. Further, considering the close proximity of the said lease to other quarries within the peripheral limits of 500 mts., opined that cumulative impact may be ascertained jointly by respective lease holders. The proponent has been requested to comply with the following:

- i. Key Plan of the lease area and its peripheral limits upto 5 kms. with the help of Survey of India (SOI) toposheets and Google Map.

**4. Quarry Project: Renewal of Basalt quarry located at Sy. Nos. 32/2 and 3 of Allorna village, Pernem taluka, North Goa District (lease area - 10,650 Sq.mts) of M/s Prashant Kamat.**

Project Proponent: Pramod Kamat  
Consultant: Ravindra Patil – rep. M/s Shruti Envirocare.

Members opined that proponent should use abandoned pits as settling ponds before releasing the impounded water in the field. Further, considering the close proximity of the said lease to other quarries within the peripheral limits of 500 mts., opined that cumulative impact may be ascertained jointly by respective lease holders. The proponent has been requested to comply with the following –

- i. Key Plan of the lease area and its peripheral limits upto 5 kms. with the help of Survey of India (SOI) toposheets and Google Map.

**5. Quarry Project: Renewal of Basalt quarry located at Sy. No. 13/2 of Cordem village Quepem taluka, South Goa District (Gross area of three leases: 02 – New and 01 – Renewal - 30,000 Sq.mts) of M/s Christopher Furtado.**

Project Proponent: M/s Christopher Furtado  
Consultant: M/s Sinha Mining Consultancy

The Member deliberated on the issue pertaining to top-soil management, dust suppression measures, proper demarcation / fencing the lease boundary, construction of settling ponds. Accordingly, the proponent has been requested to comply with the following

1. Key Plan of the lease area and its peripheral limits up to 5 kms. with the help of Survey of India (SOI) toposheets and Google Map.
2. Resubmission of revised plan for two new leases – ‘B’ and ‘C’, as applicable.
3. Floral inventory based on secondary data and presence of conservation species, if any, from competent statutory authority.
4. Planting of *Australian Acacia* should be discontinued and green belt around the lease area be developed with local endemic varieties of plant species.

**6. Quarry Project: Renewal of Basalt quarry located at Sy. No. 67/1 of Ibrampur village, Pernem taluka, North Goa District (lease area - 2,600 Sq.mts) of M/s Shalini Metals.**

Project Proponent: M/s Shalini Metals  
Consultant: M/s Sinha Mining Consultancy

Committee desired to understand the status of any on-going litigation / court intervention in respect of the said lease and decided that the proponent shall undertake inventory of faunal diversity within the impounded water body. Further, considering the close proximity of the said lease to other quarries within the peripheral limits of 500 mts., opined that cumulative impact may be ascertained jointly by respective lease holders. The proponent has been requested to comply with the following –

- i. Key Plan of the lease area and its peripheral limits upto 5 kms. with the help of Survey of India (SOI) toposheets and Google Map.
- ii. Submission of action plan / modus-operandi for release and subsequent utilization of impounded water.
- iii. Status of on-going litigation / court intervention in respect of the said lease, if any.

**7. Quarry Project: Renewal of Basalt quarry located at Sy. Nos. 32/4, 5, 6, 7 and 9 of Allorna village, Pernem taluka, North Goa District (lease area - 50,000 Sq.mts) of M/s S. Kumar Metals.**

Project Proponent: S. Kumar Metals  
Consultant: M/s Sinha Mining Consultancy

Committee, considering the close proximity of the said lease to other quarries within the peripheral limits of 500 mts., opined that cumulative impact may be ascertained jointly by respective lease holders. In addition, the proponent has been requested to comply with the following –

- i. Key Plan of the lease area and its peripheral limits upto 5 kms. with the help of Survey of India (SOI) toposheets and Google Map.
- ii. Submission of action plan / modus-operandi for release and subsequent utilization of impounded water.

**8. Quarry Project: Renewal of Basalt Stone quarry located at Sy. No. 309, Xeldem village, Quepem taluka, South Goa District (lease area - 2,700 Sq.mts : production capacity – 2,218 m<sup>3</sup> per year) of M/s. Mohan Sheldekar.**

Project Proponent: Mr. Mohan Sheldakar  
Consultant: M/s Nishant.S. Kurade and Associates

The proponent has been requested to comply with the following –

1. Submission of complete form I and XIV.
2. Management of top-soil / overburden disposal, Measures to address slope stability and management of water body adjacent to the quarry.

**9. Quarry Project: Renewal of Basalt quarry located at Sy. No. 32/9(P) of Ibrampur village, Pernem taluka, North Goa District (lease area – 45,500 Sq.mts) of M/s Gajanan Zarpkar.**

Project Proponent: Mr. Gajanan Zarpkar  
Consultant: M/s Nishant.S. Kurade and Associates

Committee, considering the close proximity of the said lease to other quarries within the peripheral limits of 500 mts., opined that cumulative impact may be ascertained jointly by respective lease holders. In addition, the proponent has been requested to comply with the following –

- i. Key Plan of the lease area and its peripheral limits upto 5 kms. with the help of Survey of India (SOI) toposheets and Google Map.

**10. Quarry Project: Renewal of Basalt Stone quarry located at Sy. No. 64, Barcem village, Quepem taluka, South Goa District (lease area – 7,000 Sq.mts) of M/s. Rosario Noronha.**

Project Proponent: Mr. Rosario Noronha  
Consultant: M/s Nishant. S. Kurade and Associates

The proponent has been requested to comply with the following –

- i. Key Plan of the lease area and its peripheral limits upto 5 kms. with the help of Survey of India (SOI) toposheets and Google Map.
- ii. Management of top-soil / overburden disposal, as well as measures to address slope stability and provision for storm-water drain, especially during monsoon.

**11. Quarry Project: Renewal of Basalt Stone quarry located at Sy. No. 102/0 of Barcem village, Quepem taluka in South Goa District (lease area - 10,000 Sq.mts ) of Mr. Satyandra Faldessai.**

Project Proponent: Mr. Satyandra Faldessai  
Consultant: M/s Nishant. S. Kurade and Associates

The proponent has been requested to comply with the following –

- i. Construct approach road to the quarry site and appropriate provision for congestion-free traffic management.
- ii. Undertaking from the lease holder not to extend stone extraction spatially beyond near-vertical exposed cliff-portion bordering one side of a lease.
- iii. Floral inventory based on primary data and presence of conservation species, if any, of the buffer of 1km. beyond the vertical cliff area

**12. Quarry Project: Renewal of Basalt Stone quarry located at Sy. No. 105/1 of Barcem Village, Quepem Taluka South Goa District (lease area - 7,000 Sq.mts ) of Mr. Prasad Rama Naik Dessai.**

Project Proponent: Mr. P rasad Rama Naik Dessai  
Consultant: M/s Nishant. S. Kurade and Associates

The Committee observed that the lease consists of small rising mounds, the proposed activity will result into a significant man-made low lying area with flawed drainage patterns.

The proponent has been requested to comply with the following –

- i. Key Plan of the lease area and its peripheral limits upto 5 kms. with the help of Survey of India (SOI) toposheets and Google Map.
- ii. Contour map of the proposed plot along with mining / quarrying plan should be submitted.
- iii. Plan of vehicular movement from quarry to the main road (i.e. Traffic Management Plan) considering its proximity to the inter-village (i.e. Padi – Gokulde) road.

At the end of all presentations and subsequent detailed deliberations in light of Office Memorandum (O.M.) No. L-11011/47/2011 – IA.2(M) dated 18<sup>th</sup> May 2012 issued by the Ministry of Environment and Forests (MoEF), Govt. of India in compliance to the ‘Order’ of Hon’ble Supreme Court dated 27<sup>th</sup> February 2012 in I. A. no. 12-13 of 2011 in SLP (C) No. 19628-19629 of 2009 in the matter of Deepak Kumarr. etc., V/s State of Haryana and Ors., the Committee noted that all the presentations made by consultants concerned have not been in compliance with the mandated procedure under Category “B” projects w. r. t.

engaging the services of Environmental Consultants accredited by QCI – NABET. Hence, the Committee has decided that proposals be re-submitted / presented for a fresh appraisal following the procedure prescribed under EIA Notification, 2006.

Dr. Pramod Pathak, Chairman, Goa-SEIAA also attended the meeting for a brief period to oversee the proceedings of SEAC meeting.

The meeting ended with vote of thanks to the Chair.

**Dr. Ashok G. Dessai** \_\_\_\_\_ *Sd./-* \_\_\_\_\_

**Dr. Manoj R. Borkar** \_\_\_\_\_ *Sd./-* \_\_\_\_\_

**Mrs. Anita A. B. Barreto** \_\_\_\_\_ *Sd./-* \_\_\_\_\_

**Mrs. Ashwinin Pai Panandikar** \_\_\_\_\_ *Sd./-* \_\_\_\_\_

**Dr. P. K. John** \_\_\_\_\_ *Sd./-* \_\_\_\_\_

**Shri. Suhas Gaonkar** \_\_\_\_\_ *Sd./-* \_\_\_\_\_

**Shri. Jaganath Hirkude** \_\_\_\_\_ *Sd./-* \_\_\_\_\_

*Sd./-*  
**Dr. Mohan R. Girap**  
Secretary, Goa-SEAC

*Sd./-*  
**Prof. Antonio Jaime C. Afonso**  
Chairman, Goa-SEAC

Place: Patto, Panaji  
Date: 20<sup>th</sup> March 2014



## ANNEXURE – 1

### List of members who attended the 17<sup>th</sup> Goa-SEAC meeting

- |   |                    |
|---|--------------------|
| 1. Prof. Antonio Jaime C. Afonso, St. Istevam | <b>Chairman</b>    |
| 2. Dr. Ashok G. Dessai, Margao                | - <i>Member</i>    |
| 3. Dr. Manoj R. Borkar, Nuvem                 | - <i>Member</i>    |
| 4. Mrs. Anita B. Barreto, Panaji.             | - <i>Member</i>    |
| 5. Mrs. Ashwini Pai Panandikar, Bambolim      | - <i>Member</i>    |
| 6. Dr. P. K. John, Alto-St.Cruz               | - <i>Member</i>    |
| 7. Mr. Suhas Gaonkar, Canacona                | - <i>Member</i>    |
| 8. Mr. Jaganath Hirkude, Verna                | - <i>Member</i>    |
| 9. Dr. Mohan R. Girap, Panaji                 | - <i>Secretary</i> |

\*\*\*\*\*