

**Minutes of the 27<sup>th</sup> Goa State Expert Appraisal Committee  
(Goa-SEAC) meeting held on 20<sup>th</sup> November 2014 at 10.30 a.m. in the  
Conference Room of the Goa State Pollution Control Board (GSPCB),  
Patto, Panaji**

The twenty seventh meeting of the Goa-SEAC was held on 20<sup>th</sup> November 2014 in the Conference room of the GSPCB at 10.30 a.m. under the Chairmanship of Prof. Antonio Jaime Afonso. The list of members who attended the meeting is annexed (refer “Annexure – I”).

At the outset, Chairman welcomed the Members and requested Secretary, SEAC to proceed as per the Agenda items (refer Annexure – 2) for detailed discussion, deliberation and suitable recommendations. Accordingly, five (05 nos.) project proposals which were reverted back to Goa-SEAC (*hereinafter referred as Committee*) by the Goa-SEIAA (*hereinafter referred as Authority*), based on the decision taken during its 14<sup>th</sup> meeting held on 3<sup>rd</sup> November 2014, to ascertain and verify submission of compliances sought by the Committee, subsequent to site visits followed by project presentations made during the Committee meetings, were examined for further recommendation. Accordingly, as mandated by the Authority, the Committee perused all the documents submitted by the respective Project Proponents (PPs’), in fulfilment of the prescription / observations. The Committee verified the information / compliances for its contents, relevance, appropriateness and authentication, before arriving at a decision / recommendation on such project proposals. The status of the observation-specific compliances (refer Annexure – 2(A-a-e)) are as under –

A. Proposed construction of Commercial-cum-Residential complex in Survey No. 276/1 of Morombi-O- Grande village, (Chimbel), Tiswadi Taluka by **M/s Amit M. Sukhthankar**. (*Consultant: M/s Sadekar Enviro Engineers, Panaji*).

1. Submitted and complied.
2. Submitted. However, Geo-technical report of the soil needs be signed and authenticated by executing authority.
3. Submitted. However, listing of fauna furnished lacks a column on IWPA Schedules, the same may be integrated and the table revised. The inventory of birds shows presence on the site and its buffer zone, Pea Fowl and Oriental ibis, the former being an IWPA, 1972 Schedule-1 species and the latter an IUCN species of conservation concern. The PP, in consultation with the officer of the Chief Wildlife Warden (CWW), Department of Forest, Goa shall submit in-situ / ex-situ conservation action plan and provide a financial budgetary commitment towards the same.

4. Submitted. However, data in respect of green-belt plantation details is only qualitative in nature and as such, quantitative data needs be furnished.
5. Partially submitted. Disaster Management Plan / Fire Risk Assessment Plan needs to include provision proposed for Public Address (PA) and Alarm system. However, all such technical reports / information need to be re-submitted and authenticated by the Firm / Authority concerned or PP.
6. Not complied.

The **Committee has recommended the proposal** for grant of prior environmental clearance (EC) for the said proposal subject to re-submission of relevant details as mentioned above.

B. Proposed construction of residential-Cum-Commercial complex in survey No.21/2-D, Baingium village, Tiswadi taluka, North Goa, by **M/s Milroc Good Earth Property & Developers L. Margao.** (*Consultant: M/s Sadekar Enviro Engineers, Panaji.*)

1. Submitted and complied.
2. Submitted. However, in view of presence of IWPA, 1972 Schedule-1 species, PP, in consultation with the officer of the Chief Wildlife Warden (CWW), Department of Forest, Goa shall submit in-situ / ex-situ conservation action plan and provide a financial budgetary commitment towards the same.
3. In respect of inventorying Ephemeral Flush Vegetation (EFV) from the lateritic sub-strata, PP needs to submit the details at appropriate stage and season.
4. Submitted and complied.
5. Submitted and complied.

The **Committee has recommended the proposal** for grant of prior environmental clearance (EC) for the said proposal subject to re-submission of relevant details as mentioned above.

C. Proposed Group Housing and Commercial project at Survey No. 40/0 of village Vanellim Salcete South Goa by **M/s Akar Creations Pvt. Ltd.** (*Consultant: J.M. EnviroNet (P) Ltd. Gurgaon, Haryana.*)

Based on the verification of the compliances to site/project-specific observations, the **Committee has recommended the proposal** for grant of environmental clearance (EC) for the said proposal.

D. Proposed residential Development with convenient shopping at plot bearing Sy. No. 12/1 (P), 13/1 A (P) and 13/1-B (P) at village Panelim, Taluka Tiswadi Goa by **In**

**Orbit Malls (India) Pvt. Ltd.** (*Consultant: M/s Aditya Environmental services Pvt. Ltd., Mumbai*).

On the verification of the compliances submitted, the Committee noted that the PP has *either* not complied *or* partially complied with the site/project-specific observations as informed. Accordingly, the **Committee has decided to appraise the proposal only after submission of relevant compliance / information by the PP.**

- E. Proposed development of residential complex in land bearing P.T. Sheet no. 121 & Chalta No. 2,3,4,38,39 & P.T. Sheet No. 130 & Chalta no. 33 of St. Inez village, Tiswadi Taluka by **M/s Marvel Resorts Pvt. Ltd.**, (*Consultant: M/s Aditya Environmental services Pvt. Ltd. , Mumbai*).

The Committee observed that the PP has *neither* complied with any of the site/project-specific observations of the Committee *nor* of the Authority till date. Accordingly, the **Committee has decided to appraise the proposal only after submission of relevant compliance / information by the PP and its scrutiny / verification thereafter.**

This was followed by four (*4 nos.*) project presentations by Project Proponents (PPs') / environmental consultants concerned before the Committee. Subsequently, after due post-presentation discussions / deliberations, the Committee desired to seek project-specific compliance as under -

1. **M/s Counto Metals & Mining Co. Ltd.**, Panaji - for proposed expansion of twin jetty with common deck in Tixem, Cottombi village, Bicholim taluka, North Goa.  
(Environmental consultant – M/s Aditya Environmental Services, Mumbai)
  - a. Considering the perishable nature of some trade commodities likely to be handled / stored / transported at the proposed facility, PP needs to submit details w.r.t. its storage and contingency plan for disposal of the same (in the event of spoilage during storing/handling).
  - b. To ascertain and verify soil compatibility *vis-a-vis* proposed list of plant species for plantation / landscape and submit feasibility status to this effect.
  - c. Considering the submission of limited documentation / presentation in respect of baseline environmental data on Primary Biodiversity Inventorization (PBI), with specific reference to avifaunal listing, PP needs to submit at least one-season database for appraisal and suggesting suitable prescriptions.
2. **M/s Kamat Real Estate Developers**, Panaji - for proposed residential-cum-commercial complex at Caranzalem, Tiswadi taluka, North Goa.

The Committee, subsequent to site-inspection, has noted that the proposal is seeking post-facto environmental clearance. However, PP accepted the delay and presented / put-forth the circumstances as well as reasons for such a unintentional lapse in delayed submission of application which is reported to be due to revision in non-FAR areas during the initial phase of project execution. Thus, the PP requested to consider and appraise the proposal accordingly. Accordingly, Committee sought submission of - effect

- a. To submit official communication specifying valid reasons / circumstances for delayed submission of proposal for post-facto environmental clearance.
  - b. To submit NOC from Department of Forests for tree-felling at the site.
  - c. To submit detailed inventory on primary biodiversity compiled for a buffer radius of 2 kms. around the project site including wetlands, if any.
  - d. To submit the list of local varieties of plant species to be used for landscaping / green-area development.
3. **M/s Devashri Real Estate Developer**, Panaji - for proposed residential complex on plot bearing Survey no.361/1, (part), plot at Socorro, Bardez taluka, North Goa district.
- (Environmental consultant – M/s Sadekar Enviro Engineers, Panaji)
- a. To submit demographic / socio-economic status about Socorro village.
  - b. To submit details in respect of top-soil / debris management during construction phase.
  - c. To submit budgetary provision for monitoring and sustainability of the proposed Environment Management Plan (EMP) as well as initiatives proposed towards Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR).
  - d. To re-submit the database on biodiversity inventory after incorporating IWPA status w.r.t. occurrence of Scheduled species reported on site. In view of the presence of such Schedule-1 species, the PP, in consultation with the officer of the Chief Wildlife Warden (CWW), Department of Forest, Goa shall submit in-situ / ex-situ conservation action plan and provide a financial budgetary commitment towards the same.
  - e. In respect of inventorying Ephemeral Flush Vegetation (EFV) from the lateritic sub-strata, PP needs to submit the details at appropriate stage and season.

f. To monitor presence / movement of any floral / faunal species of 'conservation concern' (as per IWPA, 1972 and IUCN) during the initial phase of project execution and report accordingly.

4. **M/s Raheja Universal (Pvt.) Ltd.**, Mumbai - for proposed residential complex in village Carmona, Salcet taluka, South Goa district.

(Environmental consultant – M/s Enviro Analysts and Engineers Pvt. Ltd., Mumbai)

*Total plot Area - 8,8874.00 sq.mt and Proposed Built Area – 48,717.76 sq.mts.*

During the post-presentation discussions, the Committee noted about PP's submission in respect of some mis-conception by earlier Committee / Authority while appraising / considering the proposal for which prior environmental clearance (EC) was rejected. Further, the Committee noted that –

- (i) The revised proposal has been scaled down significantly and has been designed considering the local ecology and demography.
- (ii) There has been no reduction in the density of green-cover (*i.e. mangroves*), especially along the river-front, since the time of acquisition of plot till date as displayed through the series of Google images over a period of years. The green-cover comprised of coconut trees/grove with a land parcel as 'orchard', which was earlier perceived as mangroves. However, PP accepted the fact that there exist a small patch of *Acanthus ilicifolius* in the proximity of the plot besides a few trees of *Avicennia marina*.
- (iii) There was an accidental fire in the area and accordingly, the Department of Forest had conducted a *panchanama*. Subsequently, trees were replanted with optimum survival rate as on date and supported with the display of Google image.
- (iv) As regard to approach / access to the proposed site, it was informed that there exist three (03 nos.) roads with variable width.
- (v) Empirical data along with simulation on traffic density on the adjacent and the main road suggest that existing road commensurate with the current and calculated / projected traffic density after completion of the project.
- (vi) PP has preliminary discussions with the Department of Forests for establishing a Wetland Interpretation Center (WIC) in Goa, as a part of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) initiatives vis-a-vis project proposal. In addition, PP has proposed other CSR-related initiatives of local relevance.

In view of the above, the Committee has sought submission / compliance to the following –

- a. To submit demographic / socio-economic status about Carmona village.

- b. To submit detailed Traffic Management Plan (TMP) / alternate access roads superimposed on approved plan / map on a decipherable scale in light of the existing village / approach roads.
- c. To submit provisions proposed for Fire and Risk Assessment.
- d. To submit budgetary provision for monitoring and sustainability of the proposed Environment Management Plan (EMP).
- e. To submit a 'Concept Note' on the proposed "Wetland Interpretation Center" and feasibility statement (from Department of Forests) for records.

Thus, Committee decided to re-appraise and consider the above-referred project proposals (*i.e. (1) to (4)*) on receipt of relevant compliances from respective project proponents, prior to forward suitable recommendations to the Authority.

The meeting ended with vote of thanks to the Chair.

**Dr. Manoj R. Borkar**

\_\_\_\_\_ *Sd./-* \_\_\_\_\_

**Mrs. Ashwini Pai Panandiker**

\_\_\_\_\_ *Sd./-* \_\_\_\_\_

**Dr. P. K. John**

\_\_\_\_\_ *Sd./-* \_\_\_\_\_

**Dr. Jagannath Hirkude**

\_\_\_\_\_ *Sd./-* \_\_\_\_\_

**Dr. Purnanand P. Savoikar**

\_\_\_\_\_ *Sd./-* \_\_\_\_\_

*Sd./-*

**Dr. Mohan R. Girap**  
Secretary, Goa-SEAC

*Sd./-*

**Mr. Antonio Jaime C. Afonso**  
Chairman, Goa-SEAC

Place: Patto, Panaji  
Date: November 2014

## ANNEXURE – 1

### List of members who attended the Twenty Seventh Goa-SEAC meeting held on 20<sup>th</sup> November 2014

- |   |                    |
|---|--------------------|
| 1. Prof. Antonio Jaime C. Afonso, St. Istevam | <b>Chairman</b>    |
| 2. Dr. Manoj R. Borkar, Nuvvem                | - <i>Member</i>    |
| 3. Mrs. Ashwini Pai Panandiker, Bambolim      | - <i>Member</i>    |
| 4. Dr. P. K. John, Alto-St.Cruz               | - <i>Member</i>    |
| 5. Mr. Jagannath Hirkude , Margao             | - <i>Member</i>    |
| 6. Dr. Purnanand P. Savoikar                  | - <i>Member</i>    |
| 7. Dr. Mohan R. Girap, Panaji                 | - <i>Secretary</i> |