

**Minutes of the 55th Goa State Expert Appraisal Committee
(Goa-SEAC) meeting held on 1st December 2015 at 02.30 p.m. in the
Conference Room of the EIA Goa State Secretariat, Patto.**

The fifty-fifth meeting of the Goa-SEAC (*hereinafter termed as 'Committee'*) was held on 1st December 2015 at 02.30 p.m. in the Conference room of the EIA Goa State Secretariat under the Chairmanship of Mr. Antonio Jaime Afonso. The list of members who attended the meeting is given in "Annexure – 1".

At the beginning Chairman welcomed the Members and proceeded as per the Agenda items (*refer Annexure – 2*).

1. The Committee perused the 'Notification' published by the Ministry of Environment, Forests and Climate Change (MoEF & CC) dated 29th April 2015 w.r.t. (a) extension of EC validity from 5 years to seven years for category 8 projects – i.e. *Building /Construction projects/Area Development projects and Townships*, (b) condonation of delay, to be considered by the Member Secretary / Chairman of the State EIA Authority concerned, in response to a request received from Project Proponents (PPs') seeking EC revalidation for a period upto 3 months. After referring the request received from **M/s NaikNavare Constructions Pvt. Ltd.** in Sy.No.13/1-c, 14/1-B,15/1-B at village Panelim, Tiswadi Taluka, North Goa. for revalidation of environmental clearance, **the Committee** noted that –

- (1) The PP, for the proposed developmental activity, has obtained the EC from the erstwhile MoEF which had expired in March 2015. Thereafter, the PP submitted its request to the EIA Goa State Authority for its revalidation only during August 2015. (*i.e. after five months of the EC validity period*).
- (2) As per the aforementioned Notification, the delay in submitting a request for EC revalidation by the PP within a period of one month can be condoned by Member Secretary of the State EIA Authority and within a period of three months by the Chairman of the State EIA Authority on recommendation of the State EAC concerned. Further, submission of EC revalidation request beyond the period of three months cannot be condoned.

And accordingly, **consented to the decision taken during its previous meeting held on 26th November 2015 and decided that the PP needs to re-submit the revalidation proposal afresh for further appraisal / consideration.**

2. After detailed deliberations on the submission of post-presentation clarification / compliance (*following the project-specific presentation during 52nd meeting held on 20th October 2015 and post-presentation discussions held thereafter during 53rd meeting held on 5th November 2015*) received from **M/s Minguelino D'Costa** for renewal of Basalt-stone quarry located in survey no. 52/0 of Uguem village, Sanguem Taluka, the **Committee decided that the lease holder needs to submit a requisite “land ownership documents / title for the said quarry site” for perusal / record and further decision in the matter.**

3. Subsequently, on perusal / scrutiny of documents submitted by **M/s Paulo Godinho** seeking for renewal of Basalt-stone quarry located in survey no. 14/1 of Moissal village in Dharbandora taluka, **the Committee** noted that lease details referred to in the ‘Affidavit’ are incorrect and the same is not notarized. As such, it was **decided that the lease holder needs to resubmit the same for further decision in the matter.**

4. Further, on perusal of proposal received from **M/s Ramkrishna Gaonkar**, seeking reconsideration of renewal of a Latterite-stone located in survey no. 24/1 of Mollem village, Dharbandora taluka. **The Committee** noted that –
 - (i) The said proposal was rejected earlier by the Goa State EIA Authority; vide letter no. 3-181-2010/STE-DIR/105 dated. 8th May 2015, based on the categorisation of ‘Mollem’ village as Ecologically Sensitive Area (SEA) as per the then Draft Notification issued by the MoEF & CC in March 2014. Further, ‘Mollem’ village is also categorized as falling within the Ecologically Sensitive Zone (*ESZ – i.e. buffer zone*) of Bhagwan Mahavir Wildlife Sanctuary as per the Notification issued by the MoEF & CC issued in January 2015.

 - (ii) Subsequently, the lease holder had submitted a request dated. 28th July 2015 for review and re-consideration of the said proposal in light of the proviso in the ‘Table’ annexed to the ESZ Notification published by the MoEF & CC dated. 23rd January 2015 (*refer column-2 (remarks) against sr. no. 1 under Prohibited activities – commercial mining, stone quarrying and crushing units*). Accordingly, the leaseholder has pledged that he be allowed to phase-out the existing activity within a period of ten years subject to Supreme Court modifying its interim order dated. 4th August 2006 in I.A. 1000 in Writ Petition 202 of 1995 (*T.N. Godvarman v/s Union of India*) and its Order in Writ Petition 435 of 2012 in a matter of Goa Foundation v/s Union of India.

 - (iii) Thereafter, the proposed lease as decided during 51st Committee meeting held on 15th October 2015 was inspected on 29th October 2015 to ascertain the on-

site status and was noted that it is located within 1 km. of Bhagwan Mahavir Wildlife Sanctuary.

and based on the non-clarity in the 'proviso' referred in 4(ii) above argued that such matter is beyond its scope of respective domain expertise and comes within the exclusive purview of 'legal interpretation' of the above-referred Notification / Supreme Court interventions. As such, it was **decided that the Authority should seek suitable legal views, preferably from Learned Advocate General, in considering such matters for further course of action.**

5. With reference to the letter received from **Secretary, Ministry of Environment Forest and Climate Change (MoEF & CC)** with a request to initiate receipt / online submission of proposals under 'category – B' by respective State EIA Authority, the Committee noted that the same has already been initiated and accordingly and the online facility will be utilized to its fullest capability in phased manner. The prospective project proponents / lease holders will be appraised to submit the proposal online.
6. In respect of a proposal forwarded from the Directorate of Mines and Geology (DMG), *vide letter no. 56/1564/99/Mines/3445 dated. 20th November 2015*, in respect of **M/s Maria Y. Baptista**, Arlem, Raia, Salcete, Goa seeking renewal of Laterite/boulder-stone quarry lease (*13/Lat-Boulder/Lat-stones/2000*) located at survey no. 123/1 (3.5575 Ha.) of Loutolim village, Salcete taluka, it is understood from the DMG that the said lease is currently under the status of deemed renewal valid upto 21st December 2015. However, on scrutiny of office records as available with the office, the Committee has noted that EC has been granted to the said lease by the EIA Goa State Authority *vide letter no. 3/181/2020/STE-DIR/97 dated 21st March 2013* and is valid for five years (*i.e. upto 20th March 2018*). As such, it was decided to appraise the O/o DMG accordingly and return the proposal.
7. Further, as decided during the last (*i.e. 54th*) meeting held on 26th November 2015, the Committee decided to re-inspect the proposed lease area of **M/s Edison Cardozo** seeking renewal of Basalt-stone quarry (*lease no. 11/Basalt/09*) located in survey no. 15/1, Padi village, Quepem Taluka on 15th December (Tuesday). In this context, it is informed that the Committee had earlier inspected the site on 20th August 2015 and thereafter, project-specific presentation was made by M/s Sinha and Associates, on

behalf of the lease holder, during 54th meeting held on 26th November 2015 wherein certain project-cum-site specific clarifications were sought.

In addition, it was also decided to inspect the lease area of **M/s Atharv Minerals** on the same day which has sought environmental clearance (EC) for abandoned / new lease to extract laterite-stone (*lease no. 18/Laterite/08*) located in survey no. 50/5 of Fatorpa village (5 Ha.), Quepem taluka. Further, it also decided that project-specific presentations be invited from (a) **M/s Shaikh Mukhtar** (*Site-inspection was conducted on 20th August 2015*), (b) **M/s Anand Salgaonkar** (*Site-inspection was conducted on 27th October 2015*), (c) **M/s Inancio Fernandes** (*Site-inspection was conducted on 29th October 2015*) and (d) **M/s Satpurush Metal Industries** (*Site-inspection was conducted on 27th October 2015*) on 17th December 2015 (Thursday).

The meeting ended with vote of thanks to the Chair.

Dr. Manoj R. Borkar

_____ Sd/-. _____

Mrs. A.A.B. Barreto

_____ Sd/-. _____

Mrs. Ashwini Pai Panandiker

_____ Sd/-. _____

Dr. Jagannath Hirkude

_____ Sd/-. _____

Mr. Suhas Gaonkar

_____ Sd/-. _____

Sd/-.
Dr. Mohan R. Girap
Secretary, Goa-SEAC

Sd/-.
Mr. Antonio Jaime C. Afonso
Chairman, Goa-SEAC

Place: Patto, Panaji

Date: December 2015.

ANNEXURE – 1

List of members who attended the 55th Goa-SEAC meeting held on 1st December 2015

- | | | |
|----------------------------------|---|------------------|
| 1. Prof. Antonio Jaime C. Afonso | - | Chairman |
| 2. Dr. Manoj R. Borkar | - | <i>Member</i> |
| 3. Mrs. A. A. B. Barreto | - | <i>Member</i> |
| 4. Mrs. Ashwini Pai Panandiker | - | <i>Member</i> |
| 5. Dr. Jagannath Hirkude | - | <i>Member</i> |
| 6. Mr. Suhas Gaonkar | - | <i>Member</i> |
| 7. Dr. Mohan Girap | - | <i>Secretary</i> |